

REVITALIZING HEALTH FOR ALL

Case Studies of the Struggle for Comprehensive Primary Health Care

While impressive medical and technological developments have improved health care around the world, improvements in *health* have been moderate and inconsistent across countries and communities. In response to this challenge, the World Health Organization outlined the concept of comprehensive primary health care, which involves not only providing a range of medical care from prevention to treatment, but also working to improve equity in health care access, community empowerment, the participation of marginalized groups, and collaboration across sectors beyond health.

Revitalizing Health for All examines 13 cases of efforts to implement comprehensive primary health care reforms in communities around the globe, including in Australia, Brazil, Democratic Republic of Congo, South Africa, and Iran. The case studies originated from an international research-to-action initiative that brought researchers and research-users from national public health systems together to design, implement, and assess local projects. This volume reveals the similarities among comprehensive primary health care projects in diverse national contexts and offers a rich evidence base from which future reform initiatives can draw.

RONALD LABONTÉ is a professor in the Faculty of Medicine at the University of Ottawa and the Faculty of Health Sciences at Flinders University.

DAVID SANDERS is a professor emeritus and founding director of the School of Public Health at the University of the Western Cape.

CORINNE PACKER is a senior researcher in the Faculty of Medicine at the University of Ottawa.

NIKKI SCHAAY is a senior researcher in the School of Public Health at the University of the Western Cape.

This page intentionally left blank

Revitalizing Health for All

*Case Studies of the Struggle for
Comprehensive Primary Health Care*

EDITED BY RONALD LABONTÉ,
DAVID SANDERS, CORINNE PACKER,
AND NIKKI SCHAAAY

UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO PRESS

Toronto Buffalo London

INTERNATIONAL DEVELOPMENT RESEARCH CENTRE

Ottawa • Cairo • Montevideo • Nairobi • New Delhi

© International Development Research Centre 2017

Published by University of Toronto Press

Toronto Buffalo London

www.utppublishing.com

and

International Development Research Centre

PO Box 8500, Ottawa, ON, Canada K1G 3H9

www.idrc.ca/ info@idrc.ca

Printed in the U.S.A.

ISBN 978-1-4875-0175-4 (cloth) ISBN 978-1-4875-2162-2 (paper)

ISBN 978-1-55250-592-2 (IDRC e-book)

♻️ Printed on acid-free, 100% post-consumer recycled paper with vegetable-based inks.

Library and Archives Canada Cataloguing in Publication

Revitalizing health for all : case studies of the struggle for comprehensive primary health care / edited by Ronald Labonté, David Sanders, Corinne Packer, and Nikki Schaay.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-4875-0175-4 (cloth). ISBN 978-1-4875-2162-2 (paper)

1. Primary health care – Case studies. 2. Health care reform – Case studies.
I. Labonté, Ronald N., author, editor II. Sanders, David, 1945–, author, editor
III. Packer, Corinne, 1967–, author, editor IV. Schaay, Nikki, author, editor

RA427.9.R48 2017

362.1

C2017-900121-3

The research presented in this publication was carried out with the aid of a grant from the International Development Research Centre, Ottawa, Canada. The views expressed herein do not necessarily represent those of IDRC or its Board of Governors.

University of Toronto Press acknowledges the financial assistance to its publishing program of the Canada Council for the Arts and the Ontario Arts Council, an agency of the Government of Ontario.



Canada Council
for the Arts

Conseil des Arts
du Canada



ONTARIO ARTS COUNCIL
CONSEIL DES ARTS DE L'ONTARIO
an Ontario government agency
un organisme du gouvernement de l'Ontario

Funded by the
Government
of Canada

Financé par le
gouvernement
du Canada

Canada

Contents

List of Figures and Tables ix

Abbreviations xiii

Foreword xvii

Special Thanks xix

1 Introduction and Background 3

RONALD LABONTÉ, DAVID SANDERS, CORINNE PACKER,
AND NIKKI SCHAAY

2 Summary of Comprehensive Primary Health Care Findings from the Structured Literature Review 27

RONALD LABONTÉ AND CORINNE PACKER

Section One: Increasing Equitable Access to Health Care

3 Ingkintja: The Congress Male Health Program, Alice Springs, Australia 57

CLIVE ROSEWARNE, GAI WILSON, AND JOHN LIDDLE

4 Exploring the Complex Contributions of the Community-based Safe Motherhood Program to Comprehensive Primary Health Care in the Democratic Republic of Congo 82

RICHARD BITWE MIHANDA, JEAN ROBERT LIKOFATA,
AND GWENDOLYN J. LUSI

5 Implementing a Primary Health Care Program in Bogotá,
Colombia 95

ROMÁN RAFAEL VEGA ROMERO, PAOLA ANDREA MOSQUERA
MÉNDEZ, JINNETH HERNÁNDEZ TORRES, AND JORGE
MARTÍNEZ COLLANTES

Section Two: Community Engagement

6 The Role of South Africa's Government in Strengthening
Community Participation 121

NONHLANHLA NXUMALO, JANE GOUDGE, AND LIZ THOMAS

7 An Assessment of the Contribution of the Community Strategy
Approach to Comprehensive Primary Health Care in Kenya 140

JACK BUONG, CLEMENTINE GWOSWAR, AND DAN KASEJE

8 Developing a Comprehensive Primary Health Care Model
for Bangladesh 158

TAUFIQUE JOARDER, ANWAR ISLAM, AND AFTAB UDDIN

Section Three: Community Health Workers

9 The Contribution of Community Health Workers to the
Implementation of Comprehensive Primary Health Care
in Rural Settings, Iran 185

SARA JAVANPARAST, FRAN BAUM, AND GHOLAMREZA
HEIDARI

10 The Contribution of Accredited Social Health Activists in
the Implementation of Comprehensive Primary Health Care
in East Champaran District, India 202

ANIL CHERIAN, VANDANA KANTH, AND JAMEELA GEORGE

11 The Contribution of the Health Services Extension Program to
Improving Coverage and Comprehensiveness of Primary Health
Care Services in Southwest Ethiopia 219

MIRKUZIE WOLDIE, ABERA ASEFA DERESSA,
AND SUDHAKAR NARAYAN MORANKAR

12 The Contribution of Health Extension Workers in Improving the Utilization of Maternal Health Services in Rural Areas of Tigray, Ethiopia 237

ARAYA ABRHA MEDHANYIE, MARK SPIGT, YOHANNES TEWELDE KIFLE, NIKKI SCHAAY, DAVID SANDERS, ROMAN BLANCO, GEERT-JAN DINANT, AND YEMANE BERHANE

Section Four: Governance and Intersectoral Action

13 Health-Care Coordination: Building Comprehensive Primary Health Care in Brazil 255

PATTY FIDELIS DE ALMEIDA, LÍGIA GIOVANELLA, AND BERARDO AUGUSTO NUNAN

14 Comprehensive Primary Health Care Models and Strategies in Argentina 267

MARIO ROVERE, ANA FUKS, ANALÍA BERTOLOTTI, EUGENIA BAGNASCO, AND ANDREA JAIT

15 Constructing a Comprehensive Primary Health Care System in Guarjila, El Salvador: 1987–2007 282

MARIA ARGELIA DUBÓN ABREGO, DAGOBERTO MENJÍVAR LÓPEZ, EDUARDO ANTONIO ESPINOZA FIALLOS, AND CHRISTA BAATZ

16 Conclusion: Is there a Future for Comprehensive Primary Health Care? 292

RONALD LABONTÉ, DAVID SANDERS, CORINNE PACKER, AND NIKKI SCHAAY

Contributors 313

Index 325

This page intentionally left blank

List of Figures and Tables

Figures

- 3.1 Contacts by financial year by type of service at MHP/
Ingkintja 67
- 3.2 Contacts at Congress by gender, from *Communicare* by financial
year 69
- 3.3 Contacts at Congress by gender, from *Communicare* plus MHP
drop-in centre and VIP by financial year 69
- 5.1 Behavioural trend of PHC program coverage in Bogotá,
2004–9 106
- 5.2 Behaviour of PHC program coverage in group 1 localities 106
- 5.3 Behaviour of PHC program coverage in group 2 localities 107
- 6.1 Home-based Care Program 128
- 6.2 Information Dissemination Program 128
- 6.3 Child Care Program 129
- 7.1 Community health unit implementation by province
(2010 data) 147
- 7.2 Percentage of functionality ratings for community health
committees and community health units by district 147
- 7.3 Percentage of households reached through dialogue during
the CHWs' home visits by district, and by intervention and
nonintervention sites 149
- 7.4 Percentage of selected KEPH outcomes by intervention and
nonintervention sites 153
- 8.1 Utilization of primary health care centres by household income
quintile 167

x Figures and Tables

- 9.1 The interaction between *behoarz* and the health system and rural community 187
- 9.2 *Behoarz* training and roles over time 192
- 11.1 Interaction of health extension workers with governmental and community-based structures 232
- 14.1 Infant mortality rates in two Argentinian districts (1980–2011) 273
- 14.2 Four health care models in Argentina 279

Tables

- 1.1 CPHC *Revitalizing Health for All* research projects 16
- 2.1 Desired outcomes of comprehensive primary health care 28
- 3.1 Life-expectancy comparison: Northern Territory (NT) Aboriginal males and other populations 58
- 4.1 Utilization of maternity services by solidarity group members and nonmembers 88
- 5.1 Poisson models, 2003 and 2007, and relative difference model, 2007/2003 108
- 6.1 The social dimensions of community participation and health to which CHWs might contribute 125
- 7.1 KEPH measures (%) by CSA-implementing districts 151
- 7.2 Correlation of community-strategy elements with KEPH measures 151
- 8.1 *Upazilas* selected for study near Barisal and Dhaka regions 161
- 8.2 Index of performance of 20 UpHCs 164
- 8.3 Sociodemographic characteristics of the respondents 165
- 8.4 Health status and access to health care 166
- 8.5 Gender difference in utilization of UpHCs 168
- 8.6 Use of mass media disaggregated by village 168
- 8.7 Suggested mechanisms for client feedback 169
- 9.1 Characteristics of *behoarz* interviewed 189
- 9.2 Perceived barriers to *behoarz* performance 196
- 9.3 Principles of comprehensive primary health care in the community reflected by the *behoarz* program in Iran 197
- 11.1 Origin and characteristics of the respondents, Jimma zone 225
- 11.2 Availability of health extension workers and health posts in rural *kebeles* of Jimma zone, Southwest Ethiopia 226
- 11.3 Time of introduction of the HSEP with availability and use of the health posts in rural *kebeles* of Jimma zone, Southwest Ethiopia 227

- 11.4 Association of time of introduction of the HSEP with environmental and personal hygiene practices of households in rural *kebeles*, Jimma zone 229
- 12.1 Comparison of findings of our study with findings of the 2005 EDHS for Tigray region and Ethiopia 242
- 13.1 Number of physicians, nurses, community health workers, nursing assistants, families, and administrators interviewed by municipality 258
- 13.2 Indicators of the consolidation of the PHC gatekeeper role according to professionals and users, *Estratégia Saúde da Família*, four large urban areas, Brazil 259
- 13.3 Resolution and assessment of improvement in care according to users, *Estratégia Saúde da Família*, four large urban areas, Brazil 260
- 13.4 Perception of professional recognition, *Estratégia Saúde da Família*, four large urban areas, Brazil 261
- 13.5 Position of the *Estratégia Saúde da Família* within the health care network according to administrators, four large urban areas, Brazil 261
- 13.6 Access to specialist (secondary care) according to users and professionals, *Estratégia Saúde da Família*, four large urban areas, Brazil 262
- 13.7 Wait time for specialized procedures according to users, *Estratégia Saúde da Família*, four large urban areas, Brazil 263
- 13.8 Continuity of information, *Estratégia Saúde da Família*, four large urban areas, Brazil 263

This page intentionally left blank

Abbreviations

ABS	Australian Bureau of Statistics
AHW	Aboriginal health worker
ANC	antenatal care
ANM	auxiliary nurse midwife
AOR	adjusted odds ratio
ASHA	accredited social health activist
CBHIS	community-based health information system
CBIS	community-based information system
CBRHA	community-based reproductive health agent
CHC	community health centre
CHEW	community health extension worker
CHV	community health volunteer
CHW	community health worker
CoHC	community health committee
CPHC	comprehensive primary health care
CSA	community strategy approach
CU	community health unit
DGHS	Directorate General of Health Services
DHS	district health system
DPT3	Diphtheria, Pertussis, and Tetanus – 3 doses
DRC	Democratic Republic of Congo
EDHS	Ethiopian Demographic and Health Survey
EOI	expression of interest
EPS	Health-Promoting Enterprise/Empresa Promotora de Salud
ESF	Family Health Strategy/Estratégia Saúde da Família
FGD	focus group discussion

FMOH	Federal Ministry of Health
FPO	family planning officer
GAVI	Global Alliance for Vaccines and Immunization
GLUK	Great Lakes University of Kisumu
GP	general practitioner
GRIFIA	Gender-Related Index for Indigenous Australians
HBC	home-based care
HEP	Health Extension Program, also referred to as Health Services Extension Program
HEW	health extension worker
HFMC	health facility management committee
HiAP	Health in All Policies
HSEP	Health Service Extension Program, also referred to as Health Extension Program
IAH	intersectoral action for health
ICDS	Integrated Child Development Service
IGA	income-generating activity
ISA	intersectoral action
ITN	insecticide treated net
KEPH	Kenya Essential Package for Health
KHC	Kebele Health Committee
LMIC	low- and middle-income countries
MHP	Male Health Program
MMR	maternal mortality rate
MoH	Ministry of Health
NGO	nongovernmental organization
NHM	National Health Mission
PHC	primary health care
PHCI	public health care coverage intensity
PHM	People's Health Movement
PIC	Collective Intervention Plan/Plan de Intervenciones Colectivas
PNC	postnatal care
POS	Compulsory Health Plan/Plan Obligatorio de Salud
PRA	participatory rapid appraisal
PSF	Family Health Program/Programa Saúde da Família
QLI	Quality of Life Index
RHFA	Revitalizing Health for All
SASC	Home Health/Salud a su Casa
SDG	Sustainable Development Goal

SDH	social determinant(s) of health
SGSSS	Social Security in Health/Sistema General de Seguridad Social en Salud
STI	sexually transmitted infection
SUS	Unified Health System/Sistema Único de Saúde
TBA	traditional birth attendant
TICHI	Tropical Institute of Community Health and Development
UBS	Primary Care Unit/Unidade Básica de Saúde
UH	Union Health
UHC	universal health coverage
UpHC	Upazila Health Complex
USF	Family Health Clinic/Unidade de Saúde da Família
VAHS	Victorian Aboriginal Health Service
VIP	Violence Intervention Program
ZHD	Zonal Health Department